

## The problem of ensuring respect for economic human rights in Eastern Europe

*El problema de garantizar el respeto de los derechos humanos económicos en Europa del Este*

### Authors

Oksana V. Shcherbanyuk<sup>1</sup>, Inna V. Miniailenko<sup>2</sup>, Oleksandr M. Holovko<sup>3</sup>, Svitlana O. Shestakova<sup>4</sup>, Leonid L Tarasenko<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Procedural Law, Faculty of Law, Yuriy Fedkovych Chernivtsi National University, Chernivtsi, Ukraine

<sup>2</sup> Department of Economics, Entrepreneurship and Marketing, National University "Yuri Kondratyuk Poltava Polytechnic", Poltava, Ukraine

<sup>3</sup>State and Legal Disciplines Department, V. Karazin Kharkiv National University, Kharkiv, Ukraine (olburda@ukr.net)

<sup>4</sup>State and Legal Disciplines Department and Ukrainian Studies, Faculty of Law, Sumy National Agrarian University, Sumy, Ukraine

<sup>5</sup>Department of Intellectual Property, Information and Corporate Law, Law Faculty, Ivan Franko Lviv National University, Lviv, Ukraine

*Fecha de recibido: 2020-11-07*

*Fecha de aceptado para publicación: 2020-12-10*

*Fecha de publicación: 2020-12-15*



### Abstract

Observance of economic rights is the basis of stable economic development of the country. The state is obliged to create appropriate conditions for self-realization. Each state must properly evaluate the work of a person and guarantee decent living conditions. The purpose of the scientific article is to establish the level of economic human rights in Eastern Europe, the factors influencing the implementation of economic human rights, to establish a causal link between economic development and the level of economic human rights in certain countries, to introduce compliance issues, to insert the issue of observance of these rights and development of ways to improve the conditions of observance of economic human rights. A logical, elemental and theoretical method, a method of generalization and analogy, comparison and analysis were used in order to achieve this goal. The level of economic development of Eastern European countries has been established, in particular those that are part of the EU and those that were part of the former Soviet Union. The factors influencing the realization of economic human rights (historical, social, economic and legal) are clarified. A causal link has been established between the economic development of the country, the minimum salary, the consumer price index, the unemployment rate, domestic lending and respect for economic human rights. The problems of observance of economic rights in the countries are clarified. Eastern Europe has the next list of problem issues: low level of economic development, job cuts, low minimum salaries, inadequate conditions for attracting investors, migration processes. It is proposed to improve the main ways of observing economic human rights, which are to reform the legal and economic spheres. Such process will directly affect the improvement and stabilization of the economy.

**Keywords:** Economic Rights, Unemployment, Private Sector, Property Rights, Economic Development, Decent Living Conditions.



## Resumen

La observancia de los derechos económicos es la base del desarrollo económico estable del país. El estado está obligado a crear las condiciones adecuadas para la autorrealización. Cada estado debe evaluar adecuadamente el trabajo de una persona y garantizar condiciones de vida dignas. El propósito del artículo científico es establecer el nivel de derechos humanos económicos en Europa del Este, los factores que influyen en la implementación de los derechos humanos económicos, establecer un vínculo causal entre el desarrollo económico y el nivel de derechos humanos económicos en ciertos países, introducir cuestiones de cumplimiento, para insertar el tema de la observancia de estos derechos y el desarrollo de formas de mejorar las condiciones de observancia de los derechos humanos económicos. Se utilizó un método lógico, elemental y teórico, un método de generalización y analogía, comparación y análisis para lograr este objetivo. Se ha establecido el nivel de desarrollo económico de los países de Europa del Este, en particular los que forman parte de la UE y los que formaban parte de la antigua Unión Soviética. Se aclaran los factores que influyen en la realización de los derechos humanos económicos (históricos, sociales, económicos y legales). Se ha establecido un vínculo causal entre el desarrollo económico del país, el salario mínimo, el índice de precios al consumidor, la tasa de desempleo, el crédito interno y el respeto a los derechos humanos económicos. Se aclaran los problemas de observancia de los derechos económicos en los países. Europa del Este tiene la siguiente lista de problemas: bajo nivel de desarrollo económico, recortes de empleo, salarios mínimos bajos, condiciones inadecuadas para atraer inversores, procesos de migración. Se propone mejorar las principales formas de observancia de los derechos humanos económicos, que son reformar el ámbito jurídico y económico. Dicho proceso afectará directamente la mejora y estabilización de la economía.

**Palabras clave:** Derechos Económicos, Desempleo, Sector Privado, Derechos de Propiedad, Desarrollo Económico, Condiciones de Vida Dignas.



## Introduction

The countries of Eastern Europe are countries of two legal and economic dimensions. One group of them belongs to the countries that are members of the European Union, while others belong to the countries that were formerly part of the former Soviet Union. The economies of these countries, and their economic rights, have historically developed in different political contexts. Therefore, in countries with economies in transition, the economy has been transformed along with economic rights.

The economic instability of the country and the inability to fully ensure the implementation and observance of economic rights encourage the population to migrate. This process entails a number of problematic issues in other areas of life. Economic crises, which occur periodically in all countries of the world, certainly have a negative impact on economic rights, but such a situation should not globally affect the observance of economic human rights.

## Literature review

The European economic crisis has had a major impact on people's socio-economic rights. It is seen that the economic crisis may adversely affect the institutional and financial capacity of the country to fully ensure the rule of law and protect human rights. States are obliged, despite all economic crises, to ensure the realization of economic human rights and not to lower the rule of law (Cernic, 2016). Rights can matter if they can be secured (Neier, 2006).

The country is obliged to ensure the realization of constitutional rights and freedoms by guaranteeing everyone the opportunity to enjoy all human and civil rights and freedoms, the creation of a certain mechanism and certain guarantees for their implementation. Economic rights have an important and leading place in the system of human and civil rights, due to their nature, form, content and special scope. Economic rights have a significant impact on civil, cultural, social, political and all other human and civil rights and freedoms and are a significant guarantee of their implementation (Sul'zhenko, 2011).

Economic rights and human freedoms are certain economic goods and rights to these welfares. It is about the right to receive, protect, preserve, possess, use them and dispose. The content of economic human rights and freedoms is the acquisition of legal registration of material goods as a result of the recognition and consolidation of economic human rights (Frolov, 2004).

Economic rights provide a person with free disposal of production (economic) activity, which is the basis of existence and development of society. They are created to enable individuals to freely look for and find sources of income and to support their lives and the lives of their beloved. It is quite difficult to single out a full list of economic rights of citizens in our modern world. It is quite difficult to distinguish them from social and cultural rights.

Distinguishing in the structure of socio - economic rights economic and social ones, nature (negative or positive), belonging to a particular law, can be proposed as a criterion for their delimitation. Economic rights include rights that have a negative nature of any benefits that allow an individual to independently enter the economic sphere of society: property rights, the right to freedom of economic activity, the right to work (Sakharova, 2007).

A characteristic feature of economic and social rights is that their implementation requires control and state support. As a result, scientific positions concerning the definition of the essence of modern categories of human rights and freedoms are quite ambiguous. The generalization and scientific analysis of the classification of socio-economic rights is complicated by such fact that the categories of rights cannot be based on only one and the same criteria (Bazarova et al., 2017).

At the international level, human rights are defined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (adopted in 1948) and defined in two international legal instruments that are mandatory for Eastern European countries - the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR, adopted in 1966) and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR, adopted in 1966).

To point out the different nature of these rights, especially with regard to the ways in which they are exercised, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights sets out a list of economic rights: the right to work, the right to a decent standard of living, which are "recognized" by countries. Economic rights can only be exercised gradually and may not be directly available. Economic rights are ensured through the active role of the state with the involvement of financial and material resources. The provisions of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights were formulated in the form of a program. States must ensure the realization of these rights but also take into account national specificities. The monitoring mechanism consists of a reporting procedure (Article 16) (UNESCO, n./d.).



A lot of social, economic and cultural rights are subject to gradual realization. The UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) (1990) has obliged the states to implement immediately a certain list of rights and responsibilities, in particular: the obligation to ensure equal rights of men and women to exercise economic, social and cultural rights (Article 3); providing all workers with a fair salary and equal pay for equal work without any discrimination and guarantee gender equality (women's working conditions are not worse than men's) (Article 7 (a) (1)); ensuring the right to form, join and strike unions (Article 8); protection of children from economic and social exploitation, including the adoption of legislation providing a minimum age for employment and punishment for involving children in dangerous working conditions (Article 10 (3)) and many others (CESCR).

The economic rights that are set out in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: the right to work, safe working conditions, a fair salary, the formation of trade unions and the right to join them (International Justice Resource Center, n./d.).

The systemic crisis of the 21st century is inequality. There has been an increase in inequality in recent decades, which is reflected in: stagnation of wages and collective negotiations; violation of labor rights; corruption in public services and outdated social protection systems; discriminatory legal frameworks that contribute to a very high return on private capital; fiscal policy aimed at the rich; economic policy that positions poverty; anti-democratic capture of decision-making processes by the global elite.

Growing inequality is both a cause and a consequence of human rights violations. The scientist positions the connection between systemic human rights violations caused by inequality and subsequent deprivation of human rights. Researchers studying human rights have unanimously argued that inequality is the antithesis of human rights (Biyani, 2019).

The established list of socio-economic rights in different countries is different. They are called: the right to education, the right to universal public services, health care and other public services. Everyone has these rights. The state is obliged to ensure the realization of socio-economic rights through funding and other ways.

The right to adequate living conditions may take the form of specific rights in less economically developed countries. For example, it might be the right to have food, water, the right to exist. In the

countries of industrial and post-industrial economies, decent living conditions are provided through payments in the form of social assistance, unemployment benefits and assistance to the disabled people and veterans. The right to an old-age pension is also provided. Such social assistance is paid in cash and is provided for a specific group of socially disadvantaged groups in need (Ahmed & Bulmer, 2017).

The economic crisis is having a negative impact on economic rights, reducing social security assistance. As a result of this situation, states neglect socio-economic human rights, in particular: the right to work; health care, social security, housing, poverty and inequality in favor of creditors' rights to full return on their investment (Vargas et al., 2016).

### **Aims of the study**

The purpose of the scientific article is to establish the level of economic human rights in Eastern Europe, the factors influencing the implementation of economic human rights, to establish a causal link between economic development and the level of economic human rights in certain countries, to identify the problems of observance of the specified rights and develop the ways of improvement of their observance.

### **Research methods**

A logical method was used in the study of the problems of economic rights in Eastern Europe, which is reflected in the logical construction of a scientific article.

The indicators of the level of GDP per capita, unemployment rate, minimum wage, consumer price index, percentage of GDP, which is the domestic credit of the private sector, were compared due to the method of comparison.

A causal relationship between the economic development of the country, the minimum wage, the consumer price index, the unemployment rate, domestic lending and respect for economic human rights was identified using the elemental and theoretical method. The method of analysis highlights the main factors and problems of economic human rights in Eastern Europe.

The scientific work analyzes the scientific literature from 2004 to 2020, which studied economic rights in general and the provision of individual economic human rights in different countries. Statistical data of Eastern European countries (Belarus, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Germany, Hungary, Moldova, Poland, Romania, Russia, Slovakia and Ukraine) are analyzed, in particular: minimum wage, GDP

per capita, unemployment rate, consumer price index, the percentage of GDP which accounts for domestic lending of the private sector.

The factors and problems of observance of economic human rights in the countries of Eastern Europe are established by the method of generalization and analogy.

The study analyzes the indicators reflected in:

- The World Bank – Consumer price index (2010 = 100), Unemployment, total (% of total labor force), Domestic Credit to Private Sector (% of GDP) (The World Bank, 2020a; 2020b).
- FRED – Consumer price index (2010 = 100) (FRED, 2019).
- Trading Economics – GDP per capita (current US \$) (Trading Economics, 2020a-2020k).
- Countryeconomy – The minimum wage from 2011 to 2020 (Countryeconomy, n./d.).

### Results of the research

Eastern European countries include Belarus, Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Germany, Hungary,

Moldova, Poland, Romania, Russia, Slovakia, and Ukraine (New World Encyclopedia, n./d.).

We conventionally divide Eastern Europe into two parts, where one part includes countries that are members of the EU (Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Germany, Hungary, Poland, Romania, Slovakia), and the other - countries that were part of the former Soviet Union (Belarus, Moldova, Russia, Ukraine). This division is due to their group differences, which have characteristic features: the historical aspect, people's mentality, the current legal regulation, which enshrines economic human rights.

So, respect for economic human rights directly depends on public administration. The narrow interpretation of economic rights is reduced to the financial security of each citizen of a country. The ability of the state to implement and observe economic rights depends on its economic development. Such a conclusion can be drawn from the analysis of the country's GDP per capita (Table 1).

**Table 1.** GDP per capita (current US\$)

Country	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Belorussia	6029,4	6365,4	6478,7	6542,7	6649,6	6384,8	6215,7	6375,3	6586,3	6678,5
Bulgaria	6809,9	7014,8	7081	7143,5	7320,3	7661,1	8009	8350,7	8670,6	9026,2
Czech Republic	19808,07	20118,59	19929,76	19826,79	20343,68	21381,7	21863,6	22754,8	23324,2	-
Germany	41531,9	43969,3	44070,9	44139	44933,7	45321,4	45959,6	46916,8	47490,5	47628
Hungary	13113,5	13390	13261,2	13558,8	14165,7	14745,5	15114,4	15809,8	16636,2	17466
Moldova	2437,53	2580,84	2565,96	2798,77	2940,49	2953,72	3119,56	3321,62	3527,37	3715,77
Poland	12599,5	13224,6	13437,2	13632,5	14095,4	14646,3	15101,6	15845,2	16692,8	17386,9
Romania	8209,9	8416	8629,1	8965,6	9306,2	9712,1	10236,9	11029,3	11586,5	12131,4
Russia	10675	11125,3	11553,6	11731,4	11608,8	11355,2	11356,4	11550,5	11844,4	12011,5
Slovakia	16727,29	17184,26	17480,27	17578,64	18044,96	18897,1	19273,48	19829,82	20574,03	21039,3
Ukraine	2965,14	3138,47	3153,74	3160,08	3123,9	2828,89	2903,8	2988,5	3106,04	3224,94

**Source:** Trading Economics (2020a-2020k)

The most economically developed country in Eastern Europe is Germany, the level of GDP per capita from 2010 to 2019 has been growing from 41531.9 USD to 47628 USD, the second most developed country is the Czech Republic - from 19808,07 USD to 23324,2 USD. These countries are part of the EU. The least economically developed country in Eastern Europe, which joined the EU, is Bulgaria - with 6809, 9 USD to 9026, 2 USD.

If the level of GDP per capita is constantly growing in the countries of the European Union, the countries of the post-Soviet world show more

unstable dynamics. Russia is the most economically developed country in Eastern Europe, which belongs to the second group of studied countries, where the level of GDP per capita ranges from 10675 USD up to 12011, 5 USD, the second country is Belarus – 6029,4 USD up to 6678,5 USD, economic outsiders among Eastern European countries are Moldova and Ukraine.

The level of observance of economic human rights demonstrates their standard of living, which is reflected in the indicators of the minimum wage (Table 2).

**Table 2.** The minimum wage from 2011 to 2020 (current US\$).

Country	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020
Belorussia	308,5	140,3	178,8	183,6	184,0	119,4	135,3	154,6	-	-



Bulgaria	164	183,9	209,1	239,7	223,5	233,8	247,9	312,7	327,9	350,4
Czech Republic	421,2	401,2	419,5	426,3	402,9	398,8	422	573	593,2	641,6
Germany	-	-	-	-	-	1567,7	1579	1796,6	1782,8	1779,5
Hungary	369	386,4	443,6	469,5	405,2	387,3	434,1	533,2	530,4	575,4
Moldova	-	111	116,1	-	64	50,9	50,1	58,5	-	-
Poland	462,3	438,9	517,9	556,7	499	474,2	478,6	603,2	599,2	683,7
Romania	209,1	209,6	237,1	278,6	259,8	308,7	355,0	488,2	510,6	523,4
Russia	147,5	143,2	171,4	169,7	106,1	85,1	126,1	184,1	162,3	-
Slovakia	423,6	423,1	445,6	485,4	461,4	440,9	458,5	575,7	595,4	651,6
Ukraine	126,1	141,9	152,4	152,4	87,4	67,3	117,7	133,2	-	-

Source: Countryeconomy (2020)

The leader among the countries of Eastern Europe in the state-guaranteed minimum salary is Germany, which enshrined in 2018 in law the amount of 1796,6 USD, Poland in 2020 guarantees to pay 683,7 USD, Slovakia – 651,6 USD, Czech Republic, \$ 641,6 USD. The countries of the former Soviet Union guarantee a much lower minimum salary: in 2011 Belarus paid \$ 308, 5 USD, but in 2016 - 119.4 USD, Russia in 2018 fixed the highest minimum salary – 184, 1 USD, the lowest

minimum salary was recorded in Moldova in 2017 – 50,1 USD.

The essence of the minimum wage is to provide able-bodied people with decent living conditions. However, consumer prices are disproportionate to the amount of the minimum wage in some Eastern European countries. Despite the low minimum wage, the consumer price index is growing (Table 3).

Table 3. Consumer price index (2010 = 100).

Country	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Belorussia	153,3	243,97	288,65	340,95	287,09	432,91	459,03	-	-
Bulgaria	104,22	107,30	108,25	106,72	106,61	105,76	107,94	110,97	114,42
Czech Republic	101,92	105,27	106,78	107,15	107,48	108,22	110,87	113,25	116,48
Germany	102,08	104,13	105,68	106,65	107,2	107,73	109,35	111,247	112,86
Hungary	103,93	109,8	111,71	111,45	111,38	111,82	114,45	117,71	121,64
Moldova	107,69	112,58	117,76	123,75	135,73	144,36	153,84	158,53	166,2
Poland	104,24	107,95	109,02	109,08	108,13	107,41	109,64	111,63	114,11
Romania	105,79	109,32	113,67	114,89	114,21	112,44	113,95	119,22	123,78
Russia	108,44	113,94	121,64	131,16	151,53	162,2	168,18	173,02	180,75
Slovakia	103,92	107,67	109,18	109,09	108,74	108,17	109,59	112,35	115,34
Ukraine	107,96	108,57	108,31	121,39	180,5	205,61	235,3	261,07	281,66

Source: The World Bank (2020b), FRED (2019)

The Consumer Price Index (CPI) is a measure of the average change over time in the prices paid by urban consumers for the market basket of consumer goods and services (U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, n./d.). The highest consumer price index in Eastern Europe is observed in Belarus, where in 2017 it was recorded at 359.03 units, in Ukraine the CPI has increased since 2010 by 181.66 units, in Russia - by 80.75 units, in Moldova by 66, 2 units. At the same time, in the countries that are members of the EU, the maximum increase in Romania was only 21.64 units. Such indicators show the inability to provide themselves with consumer goods in countries with a high level of CPI, as the minimum salary is not proportional to the dynamics of CPI growth.

The tendency of income inequality is the result of the development of indicators for social spending, economic growth, spending on health and education, financing, unemployment, national

institutional features and corruption, investment, tax burden, technological progress, economic openness, price levels, as well as information processing (Jianu, 2017).

The indicator of observance of economic rights in the state is the level of employment or unemployment. The chain of economic rights is inseparable and interdependent. If the state cannot provide permanent employment for its population, then unemployed people cannot provide themselves with decent living conditions. Table 4 shows the unemployment rate in Eastern Europe. The largest unemployed population lives in Ukraine, their percentage of the total number of people living in Ukraine in 2020 is 8.934%. The next countries are Moldova - 5.36%, Slovakia - 5.104%, Belarus - 4.635%, Russia - 4.425%. The lowest unemployment rate is observed in the Czech Republic - 1.91%.



**Table 4.** Unemployment, total (% of total labor force).

Country	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020
Belorussia	6,098	6,078	6,063	5,981	5,914	5,84	5,65	4,76	4,595	4,625
Bulgaria	11,26	12,27	12,941	11,424	9,143	7,575	6,164	5,211	4,34	3,85
Czech Republic	6,711	6,978	6,953	6,108	5,046	3,951	2,89	2,243	1,933	1,91
Germany	5,824	5,379	5,231	4,981	4,624	4,122	3,746	3,384	3,043	3,025
Hungary	11,029	11,003	10,176	7,725	6,813	5,115	4,156	3,708	3,399	3,46
Moldova	6,682	5,578	5,104	3,856	3,694	4,185	4,098	2,978	5,473	5,365
Poland	9,632	10,088	10,326	8,99	7,501	6,161	4,887	3,845	3,474	3,04
Romania	7,177	6,794	7,096	6,802	6,812	5,901	4,927	4,187	3,976	3,922
Russia	6,536	5,436	5,458	5,16	5,571	5,559	5,212	4,846	4,585	4,425
Slovakia	13,617	13,963	14,221	13,184	11,481	9,67	8,131	6,536	5,561	5,104
Ukraine	7,851	7,529	7,17	9,27	9,14	9,35	9,51	8,799	8,882	8,934

**Source:** The World Bank (2020b)

So, unemployment in the post-Soviet countries remains high during 2011-2020. Such indicators are shown in Table 4. The cause of mass unemployment in these countries is the burden of communist policy and the collapse of the Soviet Union. The transition to a market economy led to the privatization of state-owned enterprises and the beginning of the privatization process. This situation has led to the closure of state enterprises, large-scale plants and factories and as a result - job cuts. At the present stage, small businesses have set a course for the minimum employment of individuals due to the tax burden.

There has been a sharp decline in unemployment since 2011 in the countries that are members of the European Union. A clear example is Slovakia, which in 2011 had 13.617% of the unemployed and in 2020 - 5.104%. The reason for such a positive trend in overcoming unemployment is the attraction of investment in enterprises, which began to create new workplaces. The cost of job creation depended on the region of the Slovak Republic. It is established that 75% of the total investment assistance is provided to regions with low unemployment (Hvolkova & Klement, 2019).

However, in modern conditions, indicators of employment and unemployment are not a reflection

of the real situation in Europe. This situation is due to the migration processes of the working population, which is involved in work without any account. This situation has a dual nature. First of all, the state cannot fully provide decent living conditions and, therefore, citizens are forced to look for the realization of economic rights in other countries. However, these people get money only for work they have done. On the other hand, migrants who work in other states usually have no guarantees of observance of their economic rights.

Economic rights include the right to private property. The fundamental basis of a market economy is the protection of the right to private property. The creation or (actually) expansion of property rights creates favorable conditions for the development of relations with suppliers and producers, long-term investment, general protection of economic freedom (Hayek, 2014). The realization of property rights ensures the growth of the state's economy. The development of property rights is the most important institutional reform in the transition from communism to capitalism, but in some countries this has been neglected compared to other institutions (Hartwell, 2015). This position is proved by the percentage of GDP of domestic lending to the private sector (Table 5).

**Table 5.** Domestic Credit to Private Sector (% of GDP).

Country	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Belorussia	38	21,8	22,9	23,6	27,9	25,7	26,2	27,6	29,4
Bulgaria	65,6	66,1	66,5	59,4	54,9	52,2	50	50,5	50,3
Czech Republic	48,7	49,8	51,2	49,8	49,9	51,4	51,5	52,2	51,5
Germany	84,9	83,8	82,1	79,3	78,0	77,5	78,1	78,7	80,5
Hungary	58,7	50,5	46,2	42,7	35,3	33,7	32,8	32,9	33,9
Moldova	29,9	33,7	35,7	31,0	29,1	25,6	22,8	23,2	24,9
Poland	51,4	50,1	51,1	52,3	53,6	54,5	52,5	52,6	51,1
Romania	39,3	37,6	34,0	31,1	29,9	28,1	26,5	25,7	24,7
Russia	41,7	43,9	46,0	54,8	56,0	53,1	52,1	50,9	52,4



Slovakia	81,8	79,3	65,3	54,5	49,9	46,7	45,1	43,4	42,8
Ukraine	71,1	69,6	73,5	75,2	56,7	47,3	38,3	34,5	-

Source: The World Bank (2020b)

The lowest level was recorded in Romania in 2019 – 24.7%, Moldova – 24.9%, Belarus – 29.4%, the highest percentage of private sector lending is in Germany – 80.5%, Russia – 52.4%, the Czech Republic – 51.5%, Poland – 51.1%.

The importance of lending to the private sector has been repeatedly explored by scientists in their research, in which they tried to establish the factors that determine its growth. Internal factors such as monetary policy and exchange rate flexibility have been found to be important for achieving domestic credit growth.

In the countries of the European Union of Central and Eastern Europe, the growth of credit was the result of financial deepening. Reforms in macroeconomic stabilization, the financial sector (including privatization), legal reform, and the introduction of market institutions have created favorable environment for financial deepening, which has led to the growth of the private sector and households. Lending growth can be achieved through GDP growth and per capita income (Ayano, 2014).

So, the observance of property rights is ensured by the state in the case of creating conditions for its acquisition and protection. There is a dependence on the high level of GDP and the level of domestic lending to the private sector.

The case law of the European Court of Human Rights proves that the national courts of the respondent countries either misinterpreted the concept of “property rights” or did not comply with court decisions for financial reasons (Astankov v. Ukraine, Kechko v. Ukraine, Broniowski v. Ukraine, Kopetski v. Slovakia, Bozhko v. Ukraine, Sivokoz v. Ukraine and others). Therefore, one of the problems of observance of economic human rights is the imperfection of the legislation of Eastern European countries, which allows the judiciary to make decisions that violate human rights, which are guaranteed by the European Convention on Human Rights.

### Discussion

It has been established in our research that the level of respect for economic human rights in Eastern Europe varies from country to country. It is observed that in the countries that are members of the EU, respect for economic human rights is at a higher level than in the post-Soviet states. The most vulnerable economic rights are the right to

employment, the right to property, the right to an adequate standard of living, and the right to receive wages.

The causal correlation between the economic development of the country, the minimum wage, the consumer price index, the unemployment rate, domestic lending and respect for economic human rights is proved. There is a dependence of one category on another, the impact of changes on one other.

It is proved that the factors that form the list of economic human rights and the conditions of their observance are historical, social, legal and economic. This position is formed as a result of the analysis of economic categories of countries that historically belonged to the former Soviet Union which are countries in transition and countries that are part of the EU.

Low levels of economic development, job losses, which led to unemployment, low minimum wages, rising consumer prices, migration, unsatisfactory conditions for attracting investors, insufficient domestic lending to private sector that creates obstacles to business development and, consequently, the creation of new jobs are among the problems of economic human rights in Eastern Europe. The combination of these problems hinders the observance of the right to an adequate standard of living.

It is proposed to improve the main ways of observing economic human rights, which are: creating favorable conditions for investors, which will help attract them and economic growth of the country. This will raise the minimum wage and create favorable conditions for domestic lending to the private sector; an increase in lending to the private sector. This will promote the development of entrepreneurship, which will result in the creation of additional jobs, increase production of domestic products at favorable prices and reduce the consumer price index; to regulate the mutual respect for the rights of migrants at the international level. This will ensure the economic rights of citizens outside the state of citizenship.

Defining a political course, developing strategies and reforming the legal and economic spheres will have a direct impact on improving and stabilizing the economies of Eastern Europe.

### Conclusions

So, studying the problems of economic human rights in Eastern Europe, we can conclude that the countries of the post-Soviet world have not reached a sufficient economic level to ensure full economic human rights. At the same time, the countries of the EU show the best indicators of economic well-being of the population.

In Eastern Europe the countries of the post-Soviet world and the European Union differ significantly in the state guarantees for the payment of the minimum salary, at the same time, the negative dynamics is observed in the growth of consumer prices. Therefore, it can be argued that the right to an adequate standard of living in the countries of the former Soviet Union is leveled.

It is proved that an effective state policy in the field of economy creates the basis for a sufficient standard of living and respect for economic rights.

### References

- Ahmed, D., & Bulmer, E. (2017). *Social and Economic Rights*. Retrieved from <https://www.idea.int/sites/default/files/publications/social-and-economic-rights-primer.pdf>
- Ayano, H. A. (2014). *Determinants domestic credit to private sector in Ethiopia*. Master thesis. KDI School of Public Policy and Management, Sejong, South Korea.
- Bazarova, G. S., Birmanova, A. I., Aliyeva, I. Z., Balgimbekova, G. U., Akhmetova, N. S. (2017). Legal Content and the Issues of Classification of Socio-economic Human Rights. *Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics*, 8(7), 2078-2085.
- Biyani, N. (2019). *Economic rights are human rights*. *International Politics and Society*. Retrieved from <https://www.ips-journal.eu/regions/global/economic-rights-are-human-rights-3892/>
- Cernic, J. (2016). The European Court of Human Rights, Rule of Law and Socio-Economic Rights in Times of Crises. *Hague Journal on the Rule of Law*, 8, 227-247.
- Countryeconomy. (2020). *The minimum wage from 2010 to 2019*. Retrieved from <https://countryeconomy.com/national-minimum-wage?anio=2019>
- FRED. (2019). *Consumer Price Index for Belarus*. Retrieved from <https://fred.stlouisfed.org/series/DDOE02BYA086NWDB>
- Frolov, Y. M. (2004). *Economic rights and freedoms of human and citizen in Ukraine*. Ph.D. thesis. Odessa National Academy of Ukraine, Odesa, Ukraine.
- Hartwell, C. A. (2015). Property Rights in Transition Countries. In: Hölscher, J., & Tomann, H. (eds.) *Palgrave Dictionary of Emerging Markets and Transition Economics* (pp. 170-189). London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hayek, F. A. (2014). *The Road to Serfdom: Text and Documents: The Definitive Edition*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Hvolkova, L., & Klement, L. (2019). Management of Innovation Development in the Slovak Republic: Critical Evaluation of the Investment Aid System. *Marketing and Management of Innovations*, 1, 26-39.
- International Justice Resource Center. (n./d.). *Economic, social, and cultural rights*. Retrieved from <https://ijrcenter.org/thematic-research-guides/economic-social-and-cultural-rights-2/>
- Jianu, I. (2017). The impact of private sector credit on income inequalities in European Union (15 member states). *Theoretical and Applied Economics*, 24(2), 61-74.
- Neier, A. (2006). Social and Economic Rights: A Critique. *Human Rights Brief*, 13(2), 1-3.
- New World Encyclopedia. (n./d.). *Eastern Europe*. Retrieved from [https://www.newworldencyclopedia.org/entry/Eastern\\_Europe](https://www.newworldencyclopedia.org/entry/Eastern_Europe)
- Sakharova, A. (2007). Economic rights and freedoms: concept, features, system. *Sybyrskyj iurydycheskyj vestnyk*, 4(39), 16-21.
- Sul'zhenko, U. A. (2011). Concept and system of economic rights and freedoms of man and citizen in Ukraine. *Juridical science*, 3, 14-21.
- The World Bank. (2020a). *Domestic Credit To Private Sector (% of GDP)*. Retrieved from <https://databank.worldbank.org/reports.aspx?source=2&series=FS.AST.PRVT.GD.ZS>
- The World Bank. (2020b). *Unemployment, total (% of total labor force) (modeled ILO estimate) - Belarus, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Germany, Hungary, Moldova, Poland, Romania, Russian Federation, Slovak Republic, Ukraine*. Retrieved from <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.UEM.TOTL.ZS?end=2020&locations=BY-BG-CZ-DE-HU-MD-PL-RO-RU-SK-UA&start=1991&view=chart>
- Trading Economics. (2020a). *Belarus GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/belarus/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020b). *Bulgaria GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/bulgaria/gdp-per-capita>



- Trading Economics. (2020c). *Czech Republic GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/czech-republic/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020d). *Germany GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/germany/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020e). *Hungary GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/hungary/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020f). *Moldova GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/moldova/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020g). *Poland GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/poland/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020h). *Romania GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/romania/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020i). *Russia GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/russia/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020j). *Slovakia GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/slovakia/gdp-per-capita>
- Trading Economics. (2020k). *Ukraine GDP per capita*. Retrieved from <https://tradingeconomics.com/ukraine/gdp-per-capita>
- U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. (n./d.). *Consumer Price Index*. Retrieved from <https://www.bls.gov/cpi/>
- UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR). (1990). *General Comment № 3: The Nature of States Parties' Obligations (Art. 2, Para. 1, of the Covenant)*, E/1991/23. Retrieved from <https://www.refworld.org/docid/4538838e10.html>
- UNESCO. (n./d.). *Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ESCR)*. Retrieved from <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/social-and-human-sciences/themes/advancement/networks/lar-no/economic-social-and-cultural-rights/>
- Vargas, O., Ramos-Escamilla, M., & García, L. (2016). Human Rights and External Debt: Case Study Spain. *Economía Informa*, 396, 3-33.