

**Content analysis of regional portals “my documents”: application experience**

*Análisis de contenido de portales regionales “mis documentos”: experiencia de aplicación*

Sergey V. Babakaev<sup>1\*</sup>, Marina V. Vinogradova<sup>2</sup>, Olga S. Kulyamina<sup>3</sup>, Evgeniya M. Bronnikova<sup>4</sup>, Viktoriya A. Vishnyakova<sup>5</sup>, Lidia A. Vasilieva<sup>6</sup>, Kseniya D. Zanina<sup>7</sup>

<sup>1</sup> PhD in Politology, Senior Researcher, Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

E-mail: Babakaev.sv@mail.ru

ORCID: 0000-0001-9332-9347

<sup>2</sup> Doctor of Economics, Director, Research Institute of Promising Areas and Technologies, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation. E-mail: VinogradovaMV@rgsu.net

ORCID: 0000-0002-5051-9404

<sup>3</sup> PhD in Economics, Head of Laboratory, Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

E-mail: KuljaminaOS@rgsu.net

ORCID: 0000-0001-7715-5551

<sup>4</sup> PhD in Economics, Senior Researcher, Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

E-mail: BronnikovaEM@rgsu.net

ORCID: 0000-0002-5409-9726

<sup>5</sup> PhD in Economics, Head of Department, Department of Scientific and Technical Information, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

E-mail: VishnjakovaVA@rgsu.net

ORCID: 0000-0001-5986-2498

<sup>6</sup> Junior Researcher, Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

E-mail: lidia.@mail.net

ORCID: 0000-0002-5311-7099

<sup>7</sup> Head of the Department of Organization of Research Activities, Russian State Social University, Moscow, Russian Federation.

E-mail: ZaninaKD@rgsu.net

ORCID: 0000-0002-5348-8383

Fecha de recibido: 2020-02-08

Fecha de aceptado para publicación: 2020-03-08

Fecha de publicación: 2020-04-03



## Abstract

The relevance of topic is due to the search for new approaches and methods used to assess the quality and accessibility of state and municipal services. The aim of the article is to update new approaches to the study of the level of public services on e-government portals and to consider the possibilities of using the content analysis method of “My Documents” regional sites to identify the main directions for improving their work in informing potential service consumers. The leading methodological approach to research is the

combination of content analysis methods with expert assessment in the study of sites, based on the integration of the main models for assessing the quality and accessibility of public services. This approach makes it possible to neutralize the weaknesses of existing techniques and to increase their strengths by obtaining a synergistic effect from their application. It opens a new opportunity to consider the work of electronic sites in the context of the regional level of quality standards of information submitted in electronic form, as well as tools and mechanisms of interaction of potential consumers of services with their subject. The main results of the study are generalizations of the experience of using content analysis in the framework of the annual sociological research of the quality of public and municipal services in the Russian regions. The methods are used in assessing the completeness and relevance of the information and information provided, as well as existing opportunities for interaction and feedback with state and municipal authorities and management. The appropriateness and relevance of the study is due to the search for effective mechanisms to ensure standards of quality and accessibility of public services, submitted in electronic form. **Keywords:** state and municipal services, e-government, service quality assessment, service satisfaction, completeness and accessibility of information, content analysis.

## Resumen

La relevancia del tema se debe a la búsqueda de nuevos enfoques y métodos utilizados para evaluar la calidad y la accesibilidad de los servicios estatales y municipales. El objetivo del artículo es actualizar nuevos enfoques para el estudio del nivel de los servicios públicos en los portales de gobierno electrónico y considerar las posibilidades de utilizar el método de análisis de contenido de los sitios regionales de "Mis documentos" para identificar las principales direcciones para mejorar sus trabajar en informar a los potenciales consumidores de servicios. El enfoque metodológico líder para la investigación es la combinación de métodos de análisis de contenido con evaluación experta en el estudio de sitios, basados en la integración de los principales modelos para evaluar la calidad y accesibilidad de los servicios públicos. Este enfoque permite neutralizar las debilidades de las técnicas existentes y aumentar sus fortalezas al obtener un efecto sinérgico de su aplicación. Abre una nueva oportunidad para considerar el trabajo de los sitios electrónicos en el contexto del nivel regional de los estándares de calidad de la información presentada en forma electrónica, así como las herramientas y mecanismos de interacción de los consumidores potenciales de servicios con su tema. Los principales resultados del estudio son generalizaciones de la experiencia de usar el análisis de contenido en el marco de la investigación sociológica anual de la calidad de los servicios públicos y municipales en las regiones rusas. Los métodos se utilizan para evaluar la integridad y relevancia de la información y la información proporcionada, así como las oportunidades existentes de interacción y retroalimentación con las autoridades y la administración estatales y municipales. La idoneidad y relevancia del estudio se debe a la búsqueda de mecanismos efectivos para garantizar estándares de calidad y accesibilidad a los servicios públicos, presentados en forma electrónica.

**Palabras clave:** servicios estatales y municipales, gobierno electrónico, evaluación de la calidad del servicio, satisfacción del servicio, integridad y accesibilidad de la información, análisis de contenido.



## Introduction

The mass use of modern information and communication technologies has become an important trend in the provision of public services. Technologies can improve the efficiency and qualities of state and municipal services (Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation, 2009; Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation, 2002; Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation, 2010; Ministry of Economic, 2009; Decree of the President of the Russian Federation, 2007; Federal Law of the Russian Federation, 2010).

World experience shows that the introduction and use of electronic technologies to provide citizens and businesses with access to public services saves time and cost of these services for both the state and citizens, increases the efficiency of all parts of the state apparatus responsible for the provision of public services (Babakaev, Vinogradova & Kulyamina, 2017; Zainasheva Gabidullina & Smilgina, 2016; Kostina, 2016; Natolochnaya, Kryukova & Buslaev, 2016; Baibarin, Mashkin & Shelengovskiy, 2016; Kvon et al., 2017; Zaitseva et al., 2017, 2018; Kiseleva et al., 2018; Ishmuradova et al., 2018; Bubnova et al., 2018; Valco, 2019; Kargapoltseva et al., 2019).

At the same time, the opportunities in this area have not yet fully utilized, it is not always possible to achieve the expected results and planned social effects. The relevance increases in connection with the "digitalization of society" and the formation of "e-government". It provides interaction between public authorities and municipal government with the population through the Internet and information technology. Therefore, there is a demand to assess the quality of public services "e-government". The development of electronic channels of interaction between public authorities and the population requires assessment. It is necessary to evaluate the parameters that may indicate important aspects of the interaction of society and the state, citizens and executive authorities. The most important are two aspects of the quality of public and municipal services in the digital environment. First, the openness and accessibility of the information provided, completeness and relevance. Secondly, the availability of interaction and the possibility of effective "feedback".

The study of foreign and Russian interaction practice shows that the development of e-government services, the issues of assessing the

quality of public services on the Internet are very important (Anokhina, 2014). The Russian authors A.V Vinnitsky (2013), E.M. Bronnikova et al. (2018), considered the features of public services. Currently existing methodologies for assessing the quality of public services are focused on providing in the traditional form through the structures of state and municipal authorities. They do not take into account the specifics of using e-government portals (Filatov et al., 2018). The use of new technologies, and Internet platforms and social networks opens up wide opportunities for receiving government services in electronic format. The recipient of the service is included in the process of perception of the quality of the portal at different stages of its provision (Reznichenko et al., 2018; Orekhovskaya et al., 2019). The recipient evaluates the information about the place and procedure for obtaining public services, content, documents when submitting an application, obtaining full information on issues of interest and the availability of "feedback" in the process of interaction.

At the same time, assessing the quality of state and municipal services, especially in electronic form, can be quite difficult. This is due to the lack of a common methodology, conceptual approaches and methodologies used by state and municipal authorities in different countries. To assess the quality of public services, different approaches and techniques are used. Russian scientists use models developed on the basis of synthesis of different foreign approaches. Among them, the GAP and SERVQUAL, ACSI, EPSI models, as well as other models for assessing the quality and accessibility of services (Zainasheva Gabidullina & Smilgina, 2016; Zainasheva & Meshkova, 2015; Makarova et al., 2019).

Currently, the most common in assessing the quality of services received the American and European approaches. The American approach is based on the use of the ACSI model. This model, based on the customer satisfaction index, determines the rating. It is calculated by analyzing the indicators of "desires" and "expectations" in the context of the perception of "price" (or the level of effort the client must make to resolve the issue in interaction with the organization) and "quality" of the service.

The European approach to the analysis of the quality of service delivery is based on the model and EPSI (Europeans Performance Satisfaction Index). This model is a comprehensive system of collection and analysis of satisfaction information on a set of qualitative and quantitative indicators. Structural models of European customer

satisfaction indices are based on indicators similar to the American model, the key feature is customer satisfaction. Based on the averaged indicators of customer satisfaction, the aggregate and the customer satisfaction index (CSAT) are aggregated. Reaching 80% indicates a high value of this variable.

Despite the fact that the conceptual model of the consumer satisfaction index differs from the general conceptual model of quality, their difference is quantitative in terms of the used indicators. In fact, customer satisfaction indicators are included in the structure of the service quality assessment concept.

The Russian researchers S.I. Nedelko et al. (2008), N.N. Tereshchenko and S.I. Kasyanova (2017), A.E. Sviridova and M.A. Miroshnichenko (2018), D.V. Lanskaya and M.V. Ryzhikh (2012), O.V. Mitina and A.S. Evdokimenko (2010), A.S. Gromova and S.V. Kuskova (2013), R.V. Adzhubey (2017), A.R. Bayanova et al. (2019) developed models, methods and algorithms. These methods make it possible to assess the quality of public services and the formation of a quality assessment monitoring system, including e-government technologies.

It is important to note that these methods need to be improved in assessing the quality of public services in electronic form. They do not adequately assess the effectiveness, availability and openness of electronic services.

The subjects of the Russian Federation currently use the methods of sociological surveys, observation, expert survey, monitoring of organizations providing state and municipal services.

At the same time, there are various parameters for assessing the quality of service delivery, including:

- compliance with regulations and standards for the provision of services (waiting time in queue, execution time, number of appeals, the possibility of appealing against actions, etc.);
- identified by the surveys, observations and field experiments, such parameters of services as their availability to customers, competence of staff, the level of satisfaction with the quality of the service provided, the terms of service in terms of comfort and convenience, timeliness and efficiency of the service, courtesy of the staff, openness, availability and completeness of information.

The problems related to the effectiveness of real interaction and the development of direct and reverse communications with e-government structures have not yet found a proper solution. They need further study and research in order to further improve the quality of public services in this area. The lack of knowledge is observed on the problems of the effectiveness of the provision of services in electronic form. Many important

aspects remain poorly understood, which does not allow to identify fully the existing problems and outline the necessary steps to improve the quality of public services in electronic form. Therefore, in our study, an important place was occupied by the study of the provision of state and municipal services on regional portals of e-government. The main purpose of our study was to identify the quality of public services on the regional electronic portal of public services "My documents".

## Methods

The main method of research is the method of content analysis of the official sites "My documents". On the basis of the analysis, assessments of the relevance and completeness of the information provided were made. Regarding subject of the study, its advantage over other methods of text analysis is the ability to achieve three important technical and methodological tasks. The solution of these problems expands the possibilities of applying the method in order to achieve a research goal. First, it allows to consider issues of message quality, openness, relevance and accessibility of information from the point of view of a wider research context. Secondly, it allows to significantly expanding the subject area of the studied variables due to a wide range of text analysis units. Thirdly, content analysis can be carried out in different variations using a wide range of techniques aimed at identifying the key analyzed topics and approaches.

In order to conduct a qualitative and quantitative analysis of the content of text arrays for the subsequent interpretation of the discovered numerical regularities, the method of expert evaluation of the text was applied. It consisted in the fact that each object of study (the regional portal "My Documents") was analyzed by three independent experts.

In our study, the expert evaluation of the text was aimed at establishing time limits for searching information on the portal of public services. Such an algorithm made it possible not only to identify the required features, but also to assess the availability from the point of view of an acceptable time for information detection on the electronic government portal.

An expert analysis of texts on the portal combined an assessment of not only the content, but also the clarity of the transition from one point to another within the framework of the algorithm of actions, as well as the convenience of using an interactive website by a potential consumer. Some "usability testing" techniques were used to determine the quality of an Internet site and its web interfaces.

The usability testing technique used by the experts allowed to expand the focus of the research and



shift it towards assessing the quality of the convenience of providing services (navigating through the internal pages of the site or using an external link, using the search bar, etc.). Therefore, content analysis using these variable techniques of its modification to assess the quality of the public services portal was implemented in several stages:

- determination of the set of studied sources and development of principles of selection of sources; formation of a sample set of portals of public services for content analysis;
- definition of key topics, sections, aspects of interaction, interactive actions of the portal, based on the standards of its functioning and taking into account the needs of users;
- determination of variable quality attributes of the public services portal, objects of observation, units of analysis and units of account, as well as methods for calculating the qualitative and quantitative characteristics of the subject under study;
- development, taking into account the units of analysis and units of account, of the "route list" (script for the interactive search of information and work with the site, taking into account its work in the survey period) . It consists of tasks or targeted actions to be carried out by the expert, as the main participant in the study;
- selection and training of experts, conducting expert assessment of the quality of the site according to the studied parameters;
- filling out cards (forms) of content analysis, implementing the necessary procedures for counting signs and determining the average value for units of the account, taking into account expert estimates. This reduces the possibility of arbitrary evaluation of one expert by compensating the opinions of the other two experts;
- interpretation of the results and preparation of the final document.

The study was carried out in 2018-2019 as an optional area within the framework of the implementation of a scientific project of the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation. It included an annual sociological survey of the level of satisfaction of citizens with the quality of state and municipal services provided by state and local governments. To conduct the analysis by a selective method, 5 regions were selected, including: Novosibirsk region; Yaroslavl region; Tver region; Perm region; Altai region. The selection criterion was the distribution of regions by rating the level of satisfaction of citizens with the quality of state and municipal services, determined by the results of an annual sociological study.

The objects of evaluation were the sites "My Documents" in the selected regions: Novosibirsk

Region - <https://www.mfc-nso.ru/>; Yaroslavl region - <https://mfc76.ru/>; Tver region - <http://www.mfc-tver.ru/>; Perm region - <http://mfc.permkrai.ru/>; Altai region - <https://mfc22.ru/>.

The subject of the assessment was the content of "My Documents" (MFC - multifunctional center). A group of indicators characterizing the openness and accessibility of information for citizens and legal entities interested in the provision of state and municipal services, including for business, was selected to determine the units of analysis of sites. Indicators were presented to assess the possibility of pre-registration, the availability of a version for visually impaired citizens, the ability to leave comments, anti-corruption statement, etc. Three experts were involved to obtain initial assessments of "My Documents". An expert was a specialist who reviewed and studied websites in accordance with the methodology for analyzing the work of the "My Documents" portals and the scenario of actions as a potential consumer of services. He was guided by instructions and indicators of assessment.

Assessment of the openness and accessibility of information on the sites "My Documents" was carried out in three areas:

- the completeness and relevance of information about the multifunctional center for the provision of state and municipal services;
- completeness and relevance of information about the services provided;
- the availability of interaction.

For each direction, analysis and account indicators were selected. All indicators had an equal weight coefficient. During the analysis, only objective criteria for the presence or absence of information were used. No subjective criteria were used, which are associated with the peculiarities of personal perception (website design, content quality, etc.). The assessment was carried out according to the criterion "presence or absence of an object" as a result of its search on the public services portal on a scale of values from 0 (absence of the search object) to 1 (presence of the search object). The assessment was set by the expert taking into account the time allotted for the search, the excess of which was considered unacceptable from the point of view of the convenience of the potential user. Based on expert estimates for each parameter, the average value was calculated, which is in the range from 0 to 1 (0 - if all experts considered that the object is not on the site, 1 - if all experts considered that it was present, fractional value, if the opinions of experts differed). Normal score is not lower than 0.80 points. For each unit of analysis, the average score was calculated.

To obtain expert assessments of the regional sites

“My Documents” an assessment sheet was created in xls format containing a link to the site and a list of indicators with a field for making expert assessments.

The final index of openness and accessibility was calculated as the arithmetic average of site ratings in three main areas (analysis categories), in accordance with the methodology for analyzing and evaluating the performance of official sites “My Documents”. The indices for each direction of assessment were also calculated as the

arithmetic mean value, since for each direction a different number of indicators was estimated.

## Results

The generalized results of the content analysis of the regional sites “My Documents” for the main categories of analysis are presented in table 1.

**Table 1.** Evaluation of sites according to the analysis category “Completeness and relevance of information about the multifunctional center for the provision of state and municipal services”

| Units of analysis and evaluation   | Points |
|--|--------|
| <b>MFC General Information</b>   | 0.89   |
| Information on the location (address) of the MFC   | 1.00   |
| Guide Information  | 0.73   |
| The list of offices and branches   | 1.00   |
| Phone  | 1.00   |
| Email  | 0.93   |
| Telephone of the MFC help and consultation service   | 0.87   |
| Mode of operation  | 0.67   |
| <b>Information about branches and offices</b>  | 0.81   |
| Location information of branches and offices (address)   | 1.00   |
| Indication of the location of the branch or office on the map  | 1.00   |
| Branch or office phone   | 1.00   |
| Branch or office email   | 0.60   |
| Branch or office hours   | 0.87   |
| The list of services provided in the branch  | 0.40   |
| Guide Information  | 0.80   |
| <b>Information on the results of the MFC</b>   | 0.63   |
| Reports on the services provided and consultations for the previous year                                 | 0.73   |
| Reports on services provided and consultations for other periods   | 0.53   |
| <b>Documentation</b>   | 0.71   |
| Basic documents (charter, certificate of state registration, order on the appointment of the head, etc.) | 0.73   |
| Legislative documents  | 0.87   |
| Anti-corruption  | 0.73   |
| Agreement  | 0.80   |
| Procurement  | 0.57   |
| Procurement Plan Information   | 0.60   |
| Accounting documents   | 0.53   |

The results show that such units of analysis as “general information about the MFC” and “information about branches and offices” (0.89 and 0.81 points) identified the highest values of indicators. The list of services provided at the branch, the MFC operation mode, and information on the management of the parent organization received lower ratings. Regarding these issues, there is a lack of information or difficulties in obtaining it interactively by switching to links from other organizations. A long search is a serious barrier for a potential recipient of services.

The lowest values of the indicators are observed by the parameters “information on the results of the MFC” (0.63) and “documents” (0.71). First of all, it is ineffective to inform clients on reports on services provided



and consultations for other periods of time (0.53), key documents (0.73), and anti-corruption (0.73).

**Table 2.** Evaluation of sites by category of analysis "Completeness and relevance of information about the services provided"

| Units of analysis and evaluation   | Points |
|--|--------|
| <b>Service list</b>  | 0.58   |
| List of services by popularity   | 0.20   |
| List of services for life situations   | 0.80   |
| List of services by departments  | 0.67   |
| List of services by category   | 0.67   |
| <b>Information about the features of the provision of state and municipal services in the centers "My Documents"</b>       | 0.82   |
| Application Method   | 0.80   |
| The way to get the result  | 0.73   |
| Cost and payment procedure   | 0.87   |
| Terms of service   | 0.93   |
| Grounds for the provision of services/for refusal  | 0.54   |
| Information about the government authority providing the service   | 0.87   |
| Documents required to receive the service  | 1.00   |
| <b>Availability of field service information</b>   | 0.73   |
| Documents governing the provision of services on departure to the applicant (regulations on field service, contract, etc.) | 0.67   |
| Field Service Cost   | 0.73   |
| <b>Paid services</b>   | 0.58   |
| List of paid services  | 0.60   |
| Documents governing the provision of paid services   | 0.53   |
| Duration and cost of services  | 0.53   |
| Service Location   | 0.67   |
| Organizations providing state and municipal services   | 0.64   |
| <b>Business Services</b>   | 0.78   |
| Useful information for SMEs  | 0.93   |
| Business Offices   | 0.67   |
| Service list   | 0.87   |
| Description of services (terms, cost, necessary documents, etc.)   | 0.67   |

Content analysis of websites "My Documents" in the direction of "completeness and relevance of information about the services provided" revealed that the most inefficient way to inform potential customers on the provision of paid services. Among them: documents regulating the provision of paid services (0.53); term and cost of services (0.53); list of services (0.60); organizations providing paid services (0.64) and place of service (0.67).

In the section of information about the features of the provision of state and municipal services in the Centers "My documents" low values indicate the presence of information about the grounds for the provision of services or for refusal (0.54).

In the "services for business" section, the indicator of completeness and relevance of information about business offices and about the time, cost, necessary documents related to obtaining services for business has low values (0.67)

**Table 3.** Assessment of sites in the category of analysis "Availability of interaction"



| Units of analysis and evaluation  | Points |
|---|--------|
| Availability of version for visually impaired   | 1.00   |
| The presence of an account in social networks   | 0.67   |
| Interaction with recipients of services through the site                                  | 0.58   |
| The ability to receive services in electronic form  | 0.60   |
| Possibility of pre-registration on the site   | 0.87   |
| Ability to check application status   | 0.80   |
| Information support of service recipients   | 0.67   |
| Ability to download applications required to receive services                             | 0.80   |
| Ability to download documents to pay for services (receipts)                              | 0.53   |
| MFC website interactivity   | 0.64   |
| Existence of the section "question and answer"  | 0.73   |
| The ability to leave a review   | 1.00   |
| The ability to leave a review without registration  | 0.33   |
| Suggestions for improving the quality of services   | 0.73   |
| Interactive polls (profiles)  | 0.40   |
| Availability of links to websites of organizations providing state and municipal services | 0.67   |

Content analysis of "My documents" websites in the direction of "Accessibility of interaction" revealed shortcomings in the interaction between the client and the subject of state and municipal services. Coziness does not meet customers' expectations of the ability to leave a review without registering (0.33); pass interactive polls (0.40); downloading receipts for paying for services (0.53), interacting with recipients of

services through the website (0.58), receiving services in electronic form (0.60). Among other weaknesses that the experts found in the process of analyzing the portals, it is possible to allocate the problems connected with interactivity of a site of MFC (0.64), the presence of links to the websites of organizations providing state and municipal services (0.67), and the presence of account in social networks (0.67)

**Discussion**

The importance of our study is determined by the need to further substantiate the importance and relevance of expanding conceptual and methodological approaches to the analysis of the problems of quality, accessibility and completeness of the provision of state and municipal services. From a practical point of view, the approach focuses on the search and application of new methodological tools for studying the problem. The new approaches are due to the objective need for a transition from the "rational bureaucracy" model, aimed at optimizing the management of service quality from the point of view of the interests of state and municipal officials, to a client - oriented model of providing public services. The second model focuses on the recipient of services and involves taking into account the interests, expectations and convenience of customers. At the same time, to the criteria for evaluation of public services is still not fully developed. Customer focus indicators are often included in the list of indicators for assessing the quality of services, but they are not of a priority nature. In our case, these figures have

been widely presented in the sections "completeness and relevance of information about the services provided" and "the availability of interaction", which displayed the convenience of using the site, its usefulness for the potential consumer and the possibility of feedback. According to the results of the study, experts in assessing the quality of work of the regional portals "My Documents" relied on the methodology of content analysis of website texts. The goal was to identify gaps between the "due" and the "existent". "Due" in our study was understood as model normative documents of the international level, to which the Russian legislation aspires. The documents require the content of the standard for the provision of state and municipal services. This standard should include a list of information in the three analyzed categories. In our study, "existent being" is understood as the real state of communicative interaction between a potential consumer of services and a governmental authority providing a service on an electronic portal. Such a model for assessing the quality of the communication aspect of the provision of state and municipal services based on content analysis





of site content is effective. It helps to determine the quality of the provision of electronic services based on model requirements for the provision of services. It allows you to identify the most problematic areas that, for one reason or another, do not meet existing quality standards. Using the proposed modification of the content analysis method, reinforced by elements of expert evaluation, makes it possible to determine those areas of improving the quality of service delivery that require increased attention to improve the entire information and communication complex of e-government Internet portals. In particular, our analysis made it possible to give a general assessment of the main aspects of the openness and accessibility of "My Documents" sites. Evaluation of our data was 0.68 points, which can be interpreted as "below average". The general index for assessing the openness and accessibility of MFC sites represents the average value of the three aggregated indicators (indices). These indicators are:

- The aggregated index of completeness and relevance of information about the multifunctional center for the provision of state and municipal services - 0.75 points;
- The aggregated index of completeness and relevance of information about the services provided - 0.69 points;
- The aggregated interaction accessibility index - 0.59 points.

Thus, according to the results of a study using the method of content analysis of the official sites "My Documents" in the surveyed regions of Russia for a group of indicators characterizing the openness and accessibility of information, a not quite favorable situation in the areas of analysis can be noted. Note that for different aggregated indices the degree of approximation to the normative values of quality standards is not the same. The aggregate index of completeness and relevance of information about a multifunctional center for the provision of state and municipal services is approaching the normative threshold. The aggregated index of completeness and relevance of information about the services provided is at a level "below average". The aggregated interaction accessibility index not reach this level, being at a "low level".

In general, sites perform their functions, but they still do not meet international quality standards. Further work is required to increase the openness and accessibility of sites in those areas where ratings are found below the level of "good" (0.80 points).

In particular, in the direction "Completeness and relevance of information about the multifunctional center for the provision of state and municipal services", it is necessary to work on filling the

sites with information on the results of the MFC's activities, providing an open access procurement plan and procurement reporting documents, labor protection documents, and anti-corruption and agreements. In addition, it is necessary to create lists of services provided by branches and offices. In the direction of "Completeness and relevance of information about the services provided" it is recommended to pay attention to the formation of lists of services by popularity in order to ensure the convenience of using the sites. It is necessary to pay attention to the placement of information on the MFC websites on exit services, as well as on the provision of paid services to the population. Information on organizations providing state and municipal services needs to be improved.

In the direction of "Availability of interaction", further improvement of the work of sites is also required. First of all, in terms of interaction with recipients of services through the site (ensuring the simplicity of receiving services electronically and the possibility of payment on the portal), information support for recipients of services (providing the ability to download applications, documents for payment), the availability of links to accounts on social networks and to sites of organizations providing state and municipal services.

During the analysis, the experts revealed differences in the site structure of the selected regions, in the content of sections, in the placement of documents, in the order of interaction through the portal. In some cases, experts note a different arrangement of documents in different sections of the site depending on the region, which makes it difficult for the consumer to work with the site.

To improve interaction with consumers of state and municipal services, it is necessary to develop uniform requirements for the structure and content of sites, determine the main content of sections, a single procedure for interacting with consumers of services (for example, the procedure for pre-recording through the portal), as well as increase the interactivity of sites. Including in order to identify the views of citizens on the provision of state and municipal services.

Strengthening work in these areas will improve the quality of the provision of services in electronic form and will increase the openness and accessibility of electronic forms of state and municipal services. This will increase the efficiency of all parts of the executive branch and management, as well as reduce the overall burden of the administrative burden on society.

## Conclusions

In the course of the study, it was found that the current methodologies for assessing the quality of public services are focused on their provision in the traditional form through the structures of state and governmental authority and do not take into account their specificity when using e-government portals.

Due to the lack of common approaches and methods of evaluation of services in electronic form, a new approach to the evaluation of regional sites "My documents" was proposed.

The method of content analysis allowed to consider the issues of completeness, openness, relevance and availability of information in a wide research context by increasing the total number of variables and units of text analysis.

The method of text analysis can be used to create methods for evaluating other e-government sites. This method is able to identify the main problem areas of the functioning of portals and suggest ways to improve efficiency.

Although our results and conclusions cannot be extrapolated to all "My Documents" regional sites due to the fact that the research was largely search and pilot, nevertheless, the analysis of the sites revealed the effectiveness of our method for assessing many aspects of the quality of public and municipal services. First of all, such as the completeness and relevance of information about the services provided, the availability of

interaction and feedback.

At the same time, many problems associated with studying the quality of the provision of public services and the operation of e-government sites need further study and the search for new methodological tools for measuring and evaluating their effectiveness. Therefore, the implementation of new approaches requires further focus on finding adequate and valid methods for displaying all key parameters of the quality and functionality of public services provided in electronic form.

### Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful for the financial and organizational support from the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation, which granted it in the framework of the concluded contract on an annual sociological research to assess the quality of public and municipal's services in Russian regions as well as "Russian State Social University" for support in research.

### References

- Adzhubey, R.V. (2017). Evaluation of the effectiveness of the provision of state and municipal services to the population. *Young scientist*, 1, 135-140. URL <https://moluch.ru/archive/13-5/37885/> (accessed: 11/18/2018).
- Anokhina, N.V. (2014) E-government for the people: review of the 2014 UN study. *Political science*, 1, 28-42.
- Babakaev, S.V., Vinogradova, M.V. & Kulyamina, O.S. (2017). Content analysis of the quality of state and municipal services in the media: application experience. *Social Policy and Sociology*, 2(121), 122-130.
- Baibarin, A.A., Mashkin, N.A. & Shelengovskiy, P.G. (2016). The Northwest Caucasus from Ancient Times to the 19th Century: A Historiographical Review of the Recent Publications in the Periodicals. *Rusin*, 46(4), 119-140.
- Bayanova, A.R., Vodenko, K.V., Sizova, Z.M., Chistyakov, A.A., Prokopyev, A.I., Vashbieva, D.G. (2019). A Philosophical view of organizational culture policy in contemporary universities. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 15(3), 121-131.
- Bronnikova, E.M., Kulyamina, O.S., Vinogradova, M.V. & Volkov, D.V. (2018). Management of public employment service: Russian and foreign experience. *Modern Journal of Language Teaching Methods*, 8(10), 616-629.
- Bubnova, I.S., Khvatova, M.A., Chernik, V.E., Popova, O.V., Prokopyev, A.I., Naumov, P.Yu. & Babarykin, O.V. (2018). Research of Professional Activity Features of Ecologist at Carrying Out Public Ecological Examination. *Ekoloji*, 106, 999-1006.
- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation. (2002). Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of January 28, 2002 N 65 (as amended on June 9, 2010). "On the federal target program" Electronic Russia (2002-2010)". URL: [http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons\\_doc\\_LAW\\_90180/](http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_90180/) (accessed 03/22/2019)
- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation. (2009). Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of June 15, 2009 N 478 "On a unified system of information and reference support for citizens and organizations on issues of interaction with executive authorities and local authorities using the information telecommunication network Internet" (with changes on June 16, 2010). URL: <https://base.garant.ru/195768/> (accessed 05/11/2019)



- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation. (2010). Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation of September 8, 2010 N 697 "On a unified system of interagency electronic interaction". URL: <https://base.garant.ru/199319/> (accessed 06/11/2019)
- Decree of the President of the Russian Federation. (2007). "On evaluating the performance of executive bodies of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation" dated June 28, 2007 N 825. URL: [http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons\\_doc\\_LAW\\_69366/](http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_69366/) (accessed 03/12/2018)
- Federal Law of the Russian Federation. (2010). "On the Organization of the Provision of State and Municipal Services". July 27, 2010 N 210-FZ. URL: [http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons\\_doc\\_LAW\\_103023/](http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_103023/) (accessed 11/25/2018)
- Filatov, V.V., Zaitseva, N.A., Larionova, A.A., Zhenzhebir, V.N., Polozhentseva, I. V., Takhumova, O.V. & Kolosova, G. M. (2018). State Management of Plastic Production Based on the Implementation of UN Decisions on Environmental Protection. *Ekoloji*, 106, 635-642.
- Gromova, A.S. & Kuskova, S.V. (2013). Evaluation of the effectiveness of the functioning of the SEZ in the Russian Federation. *Bulletin of Siberian Science*. URL: <https://cyberleninka.ru/article/v/zarubezhnyy-opyt-povysheniya-kachestva-i-dostupnosti-predostavleniya-gosudarstvennyh-uslug> (accessed: 10/17/2019).
- Ishmuradova, I.I., Grebennikov, V.V., Krokhina, J.A., Pavlenko, E.M., Makarova, E.V., Solovyeva, N.A. (2018). Social and philosophic foundations of youth nonconformity in contemporary Russia. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 14(6), 143-158.
- Kargapol'tseva, N.A., Rakhimova, O.N., Shabalina, L.G., Guryanova, T.Y., Mashkin, N.A., Mirzalimov, R.M. & Popova, N.F. (2019). Student Identity and Various Procedures of its Development. *International Journal of Applied Exercise Physiology*, 2.1, 519-526.
- Kiseleva, N.I., Dorozhkin, E.M., Kislov, A.G., Ryazanova, E.L., Galushkin, A.A., Koinova-Zoellner, J. (2018). Philosophical analysis of information and communication environment. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 14(6), 115-124.
- Kostina, S.N. (2016). Modern problems of assessing the quality of the provision of public services. *Management Issues*, 2(20), 49-57.
- Kvon, G.M., Faleeva, L.V., Pyrkova, G.K., Alyakina, D.P., Mustafina, A.A., Kryukova, N.I. & Blekus, V.V. (2017). Strategic Priorities of Regional Investment Activity. *Eurasian Journal of Analytical Chemistry*, 12(7B), 1099-1106.
- Lanskaya, D.V. & Ryzhikh, M.V. (2012). "Intelligent" marketing as a kind of intellectual service. *Vector of the knowledge economy of the southern macro-region: institutional innovations, controlling technologies, knowledge management, human capital development. Materials of the IV International scientific-practical conference*, pp. 38-46.
- Makarova, E.V., Kryukova, N.I., Sizova, Z.M., Grinenko, A.V., Erofeeva, M.A., Bukalerova, L.A. (2019). Divergence of supreme values of Russian world and western civilization social and philosophical analysis. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 15(3), 97-107.
- Ministry of Economic. (2009). Order of the Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation of November 13, 2009 N 464. On approval of guidelines on the procedure for filling out electronic forms of the federal state information system "Consolidated Register of State and Municipal Services (Functions)". URL: <http://www.consultant.ru/cons/cgi/online.cgi?req=doc&base=EXP&n=478690#05497639728147284> (accessed 07/22/2019)
- Mitina, O.V. & Evdokimenko, A.S. (2010). Methods of text analysis: methodological foundations and software implementation. *Vestnik SUSU. Series "Psychology"*, 40(11), 29-38
- Natolochnaya, O.V., Kryukova, N.I. & Buslaev, S.I. (2016). The development of the public education system in the Caucasus in the pre-revolutionary period (1905-1917 years). *Bylye Gody*, 39(1), 222-228.
- Nedelko, S.I., Ostashkov, A.V., Matyukin, S.V., Retinskaya, V.N., Murzina, I.A., Krevsky, I.G., Lukanin, A.V. & Kosheva, O.S. (2008). *Monitoring of state and municipal services in the region as a strategic tool for improving the quality of regional management: experience, problems, recommendations*. Under General supervision V.V. Markina, A.V. Ostashkova. Moscow: Publisher Exlibris Press.
- Orekhovskaya, N.A., Volobuev, A.V., Kosarenko, N.N., Zakharova, V.L., Shestak, V.A., Sushkova, Y.N. (2019). Religious fundamentalism salvation or a threat to the modern world? *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 15(4), 60-70.
- Reznichenko, S.M., Takhumova, O.V., Zaitseva, N.A., Larionova, A.A., Dashkova, E.V., Zotikova, O.N. & Filatov, V.V. (2018). Methodological aspects of assessing factors affecting the sustainable development of the region. *Modern Journal of Language Teaching Methods*, 8(11), 69-79.
- Sviridova, A.E. & Miroshnichenko, M.A. (2018). Criteria for assessing the quality and accessibility of state and municipal services. *Collection of articles: Problems of society and economy based on knowledge: innovation and neo-industrialization. Kuban State University*, 2, 64-74
- Tereshchenko, N.N. & Kasyanova, S.I. (2017). Methodology and model for assessing the quality of public services, adapted to the Russian public administration system. *Young Scientist*, 4, 538-541. URL <https://moluch.ru/archive/138/38854/> (accessed: 11/25/2018)
- Valco, M. (2018). Global and Local Challenges of the interaction of natural and human sciences. *European*



*Journal of Science and Theology*, 14(5), 1-3.

- Vinnitsky, A.V. (2013). The Institute of Public Services in Russia: Prospects in the Context of European Experience. *Administrative and municipal law*, 4, 299-308.
- Zainasheva, Z.G. & Meshkova, N.G. (2015). Modern criteria for assessing the quality and accessibility of the provision of public services. *Quality Economics*, 9, 44-50.
- Zainasheva, Z.G., Gabidullina, E.V. & Smilgina, K.L. (2016). Foreign experience in improving the quality and accessibility of public services. *Vestnik UGUES. Science, education, economics. Series of economics*, 1(15), 38-43.
- Zaitseva, N.A., Larionova, A.A., Filatov, V.V., Rodina, E. E, Zhenzhebir, V.N., Povorina E.V. & Palastina I.P. (2018). Natural-Resource Potential Management of Region's Territorial Ecosystems. *Ekoloji*, 106, 495-502.
- Zaitseva, N.A., Larionova, A.A., Yakimova, N.S., Leukhova, M.G., Radina, O.I. (2017) Methodological aspects of foreign language teaching in the preparation of the tour guides. *Modern Journal of Language Teaching Methods*, 7(4), 399-409.